

## Answering the Allegation: `A'ishah angered Fatimah and made her weep

### Allegation

`A'ishah angered Sayyidah Fāṭimah and made her weep due to the former's hatred for the latter and the Ahl al-Bayt. Al-Ṣadūq says:

Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan ibn Aḥmad ibn al-Walīd narrated to them that Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-Ṣaffār narrated to them — from Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn Khālīd who says that — Abū `Alī al-Wāsiṭī informed him — from `Abd Allāh ibn `Iṣmah — from Yaḥyā ibn `Abd Allāh — from `Amr ibn Abī al-Miqdām — from his father — from Abū `Abd Allāh رَضِيَ اللهُ عَنْهُ who said:

Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ entered his home and found `A'ishah addressing Fāṭimah and shouting her.

`A'ishah was saying, “By Allah, O daughter of Khadījah, You feel that your mother enjoys superiority over us. What superiority does she enjoy over us? She is just like one of us.”

Fāṭimah listened to her statement. When Fāṭimah saw Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ, she cried.

He asked her, “What makes you cry, O daughter of Muḥammad?”

She explained “I mentioned my mother and she (`A'ishah) disparaged her so I cried.”

Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ became angry and said, “Enough O Ḥumayrā! Certainly Allah (swt) blessed *al-walūd* (one who bears plenty children) *al-wadūd* (one who deeply loves her children). Indeed, Khadījah (rah) gave birth to Ṭāhir for me, who is `Abd Allāh and al-Muṭahhar, and she gave birth to al-Qāsim, Fāṭimah, Ruqayyah, Umm Kulthūm, and Zaynab for me. Whereas you are one whose womb Allah has rendered barren so you gave birth to none.”<sup>1</sup>

### Answer

**Firstly**, we seek Allah's protection from ever believing such disgusting words could have emanated from the mouth of the Prophet صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ. May the curse of Allah be upon the liars who attribute such lies to his blessed personality.

**Secondly**, this narration is *makdhūb* (false) and one of the Rawāfiḍ's deceptions. It is rejected by both the Ahl al-Sunnah and Shī'ah. In relation to the Ahl al-Sunnah, it is very simple; they do not regard the Rawāfiḍ's narrations as credible. In relation to the Shī'ah, the isnād is ḍa'īf since there are two *majhūl* (unknown) persons present in it.

#### 1. `Abd Allāh ibn `Iṣmah

<sup>1</sup> *Al-Khiṣāl* of al-Ṣadūq pg. 404, 405; *Bihār al-Anwār* vol. 16 pg. 3

‘Alī al-Namāzī al-Shāharūdī comments, “‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Iṣmah: They have not mentioned him.”<sup>2</sup>

## 2. Abū ‘Alī al-Wāsiṭī

Muḥammad al-Jawāhirī comments, “Abū ‘Alī al-Wāsiṭī is majhūl. He narrates two narrations in al-Kāfi.”<sup>3</sup>

Ghulām Riḍā ‘Irfāniyān says, “Abū ‘Alī al-Wāsiṭī: He is not mentioned at all.”<sup>4</sup>

**Thirdly**, the only thing found in the relationship between Sayyidah ‘Ā’ishah and Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا is love and admiration. There are numerous aḥādīth which the former has narrated on the virtues of the latter and in her praise. This shows the deep love she possessed for her. So how can it ever be claimed that she hated her?

Ja‘far al-Hādī al-Shīī has written a book with the title *al-Sayyidah Fāṭimah al-Zahrā’ alā Lisān ‘Ā’ishah Zawjat Rasūlillāh (saw) (Sayyidah Fāṭimah al-Zahrā’ on the tongue of ‘Ā’ishah, wife of Rasūlullāh صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ)*. He has gathered forty aḥādīth therein on the virtues of Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا narrated by Sayyidah ‘Ā’ishah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا.

It is not intelligible for her to narrate all these narrations on the virtues of Sayyidah Fāṭimah رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا while harbouring hatred for her. She has narrated such an abundance of aḥādīth on her virtues that it compelled a Shīī to write an exclusive book on this subject. The truth is what the enemy acknowledges.

Purity belongs to Allah! When falsehood is pure, it carries its own destruction.

---

<sup>2</sup> *Mustadrakāt ‘Ilm Rijāl al-Ḥadīth* vol. 5 pg. 55.

<sup>3</sup> *Al-Mufīd min Mu‘jam Rijāl al-Ḥadīth* of Muḥammad al-Jawāhirī pg. 714.

<sup>4</sup> *Mashāyikh al-Thiqāt* of Ghulām Riḍā ‘Irfāniyān pg. 92.

<sup>5</sup> A contemporary Shīī.

